

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 14, 2019 REPORT NO. HRB 19-006

HEARING DATE: February 28, 2019

SUBJECT: ITEM #8 - Martin Breslauer House

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Martin Breslauer 1992 Trust represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 13683 Recuerdo Drive, Torrey Pines Community, Council District 1

APN 300-381-02-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Martin Breslauer House located at 13683

Recuerdo Drive as a historical resource.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Designate the Martin Breslauer House located at 13683 Recuerdo Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1970 under HRB Criterion C. The designation includes the original Torrey Pine tree centrally located on the front elevation. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Contemporary style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains a strong, flat roof form with wide overhanging eaves; split level design; various exterior finishes including vertical wood siding, concrete slump block, and stucco; concrete slump block chimney; exposed roof beams, floor to ceiling aluminum windows and doors; an obscured entry and an attached carport.

## **BACKGROUND**

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a split-level single-family residence built in the Contemporary style located on the east side of Recuerdo Drive in the Torrey Pines Community. The property is in the residential neighborhood of Del Mar Heights and its front faces west giving the property views of the Torrey Pines State Natural Reserve Extension and the ocean.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Martin Breslauer House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Martin Breslauer, who constructed the house as his personal residence.

#### **ANALYSIS**

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C but not HRB Criterion A. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The Historical Resource Research Report argues that the home is significant under HRB Criterion A, reflecting special elements of architectural and historical development of the Torrey Pines neighborhood as it exemplifies the initial development made possible by the implementation of the Improvement Act of 1911 ("1911 Act") and the Municipal Improvement Act of 1913 ("1913 Act"). The Implementation of these acts were initiated by the Del Mar Heights lot owners to create the Del Mar Heights subdivision. While these acts were important to for development of new construction as a whole, they were not unique in the context of residential development overall within the City of San Diego. Additionally, there is insufficient data and analysis to attribute individual significance of the property on this basis. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a split-level single-family home with an attached carport constructed in 1970, as recorded on the Notice of Completion, in the Contemporary style. The building is built using light-frame construction on a concrete pier foundation. The flat tar and gravel roofs are split into two sections, the upper roof (front elevation) and the lower roof (rear elevation). Both roofs have deep overhangs and feature exposed roof beams. The building exhibits an asymmetrical primary façade and is clad in vertical wood siding, stucco and concrete slump block. A large concrete slump block chimney is located on the front façade. The entry, located on a side elevation, can be accessed via the concrete steps to the north of the carport. The recessed front entry consists of the original full-length carved wood front door, which is flanked by two full length frosted glass sidelights. Fenestration consists of aluminum windows in various sizes and operations.

The front elevation is composed of two sections that visually convey the resource's split-level design. This includes an open carport located underneath the projecting bedroom level. The carport is below the floor level and is accessed from the residence through the front entry and down the concrete steps. The second section of the front elevation contains some of the main living area and is set further back. The living spaces above the carport rise higher than the flat lower roof of the rear

elevation. The rear elevation sits at ground level and contains addition sections of the main-living space. Located In between the front and rear elevations is a recessed terrace, that is accessed by both elevations.

The original landscape was designed by landscape architect Brian Wyckoff while the property was under construction and was implemented by Mr. Breslauer. The loss of most of the original plantings has severely impacted the integrity of the original landscape design and staff is not recommending the designation of the designed landscape. However, Staff is recommending that the original Torrey Pine Tree, planted shortly after the construction of the house, be included in the designation.

Modifications to the front elevation include repaving of the driveway with brick pavers completed in 2000, replacement of the original plastic sidelights with decorative glass in the original openings at the front entry in 2000; an original aluminum sliding window was replaced with glass block within the original opening in 2000; a wood door was replaced with a new door with windows in the existing opening in 2005 and an original fixed glass window was replaced with a decorative glass panel within the original wood frame in 2000. Modifications to the rear elevation include the replacement of two aluminum sliders with sliding vinyl windows within the same light pattern and in the original openings in 2000; two sliding aluminum sliding glass doors were replaced with wood sliding glass doors within the original openings in 2000, and the fixed, 2-panel, aluminum-framed window was removed and replaced with a decorative glass panel within the original opening in 2000. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling and the building retains integrity as it relates to architectural significance.

Unlike earlier styles which are generally defined by exterior decorative details, the Contemporary style focused on interior spaces and their relation to the outdoors. Emphasis was placed on integrating the indoors with the outdoors by utilizing windows and exterior living areas such as balconies and courtyards. The style was popular in San Diego in the 1950's and 1960's largely because it could be easily adapted to hillside lots. Character defining features include strong roof forms with deep overhangs and exposed beams; large, aluminum framed windows; non-traditional exterior finishes including vertical wood siding, concrete block, stucco and flagstone; sun shades, screen or shadow block accents; broad masonry chimneys; and distinctive triangular, parabolic or arched forms. Contemporary houses often incorporate angular massing; attached carports or garages; courtyards or balconies; obscured or recessed entries; and split-level designs.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Contemporary style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style including a retains a strong, flat roof form with wide overhanging eaves; split level design; various exterior finishes including vertical wood siding, concrete slump block, and stucco; concrete slump block chimney; exposed roof beams, floor to ceiling aluminum windows and doors; an obscured entry and an attached carport. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

### **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code;

flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

## **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Martin Breslauer House located at 13683 Recuerdo Drive be designated as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1970 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Contemporary style and retains integrity. The designation includes the original Torrey Pine tree centrally located on the front elevation.

Shannon Anthony Junior Planner

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner

SA/ss

Attachments:

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER R-XX ADOPTED ON 2/28/2019

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/28/2019, to consider the historical designation of the **Martin Breslauer House** (owned by Martin Breslauer 1992 Trust, 13683 Recuerdo Drive, Del Mar, CA 92014) located at **13683 Recuerdo Drive**, **Del Mar, CA 92014**, APN: **300-381-02-00**, further described as BLK 39 LOT 9 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. XX**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Martin Breslauer House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Contemporary style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1970 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains a strong, flat roof form with wide overhanging eaves; split level design; various exterior finishes including vertical wood siding, concrete slump block, and stucco; concrete slump block chimney; exposed roof beams, floor to ceiling aluminum windows and doors; an obscured entry and an attached carport. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. XX.** 

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the original Torrey Pine tree centrally located on the front elevation.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: n/a		
	BY:	
		DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,		
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:	
		JEREMY JUNG,
		Deputy City Attorney